Report on Workforce Development Program Outcomes
Submitted by the Maryland Department of Labor
November 1, 2020

P00A01.01 – 2020 Joint Chairmen's Report
Page 148

Pursuant to the requirements of the 2020 Joint Chairmen's Report (p. 148), the Maryland Department of Labor (MD Labor) submits this report on Workforce Development Program Outcomes. The committees requested that MD Labor submit a report including the following information:

- The various workforce development programs offered and the outcome data tracked by MD Labor for each program, including whether programs track data on wages and retention;
- Whether outcome data is tracked by jurisdiction and provider;
- A comparison of program success across sectors;
- The biggest barriers to success in each program; and,
- The feasibility of tracking outcomes for periods longer than four quarters after program completion.

Introduction to Maryland's Workforce System

Providing businesses with the skilled workforce required to compete in global, regional, and local economies is central to Governor Hogan's strategic vision for Maryland. Maryland's workforce system provides that talent pipeline through the various workforce development programs offered across the State.

The Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) is the federal law that governs Maryland's workforce system. WIOA is designed to integrate services to support both businesses and jobseekers through strategic cross-sector partnerships. It envisions connecting workforce, education, human services, and economic development entities to ensure strategic leveraging of resources and optimum results. The law addresses the needs of customers through establishing a comprehensive system that provides access to employment, education, training and support services.

In implementing WIOA, and through collaborative partnerships with service providers, the *Benchmarks of Success for Maryland's Workforce System* was born. The *Benchmarks* are a foundational outline used to build system effectiveness, support transparency about progress, and help State and local WIOA partners align resources and strategies. Maryland's core partners are committed to implementing the *Benchmarks,* which reflect a shared vision of excellence and provide a strategic tool for continuous improvement of programming.

The contents of this report outline components of each of Maryland's workforce development programs that are overseen by MD Labor. Although each program has different performance measures, all are administered with consideration of and commitment to the *Benchmarks*, and strive to achieve the same vision of increasing the earning capacity of Marylanders by:

- Maximizing access to employment;
- Maximizing access to and use of skills and credentialing;
- Maximizing access to and use of life management skills;
- Eliminating barriers to employment through the use of supportive services; and,
- Strengthening and enhancing the effectiveness and efficiency of the workforce system.

MD Labor Workforce Development Programs

I. Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title I - Adult; Dislocated Worker; and Youth

MD Labor receives WIOA Title I formula funds from the U.S. Department of Labor, which are then allocated to the State's 12 Local Workforce Development Areas (Local Areas) for adults, dislocated workers, and youth. These federal funds must be used to provide career and training services, as defined under WIOA, through the one-stop delivery system. Local Workforce Development Boards (LWDBs) determine the most appropriate mix of these services, but both services must be available for eligible jobseekers. Different eligibility criteria apply for each type of service.

Outcome Data
Performance is tracked in the Maryland Workforce Exchange (MWE) using wage records and case management collection of documents. Outcome data is tracked by Local Area and the State, and outcomes are measured by the following indicators of performance:

WIOA Title I Performance Indicators
Employment Rate - 2nd Quarter After Exit
Employment Rate - 4th Quarter After Exit
Median Earnings
Credential Attainment
Measurable Skill Gains
Effectiveness in Serving Employers**

** This measure is for Adult and Dislocated Worker programs only

Program Success Across Sectors
Each Local Area defines its target industry sectors in its WIOA Local Plan, which must align with Maryland's State Plan and is based on Labor Market Information for that jurisdiction. Funds are spent to support target sectors and to meet target outcomes.

Program Barriers
In the WIOA Title I Adult and Dislocated Worker programs, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:

- Performance data lags since data reported is normally for activities that occurred six months or more prior and does not provide a real time picture of the current labor market or activities.
- Federal performance standards inhibit ability to take chances on individuals with barriers to training;
- Archaic definitions of targeted groups; and,
- Insufficient funds to train eligible customers.

In the Youth program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:

- Recruitment of eligible participants;
- Retention of participants;
- Mandated 12-month follow-up;
- Issues with transportation; and
- Lack of accessible technology to attend virtual classes, trainings, or other services (especially given the COVID-19 virtual environment).

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
Participant performance could be tracked beyond the mandated timeframe if funds were available for that purpose, but this is not a requirement under WIOA.

II. Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title III - Wagner-Peyser

WIOA Title III - Wagner-Peyser is a federally-funded program providing labor exchange services to employers and job seekers statewide. The goal of labor exchange services is to help job seekers obtain meaningful employment opportunities and assist employers in obtaining skilled and productive employees.

Outcome Data
Performance is tracked in the MWE using wage records and case management collection of documents. Outcome data is tracked by Local Areas and the State, and outcomes are measured by the following:

WIOA Title III Outcome Data
Employment Rate - 2nd Quarter After Exit
Employment Rate - 4th Quarter After Exit
Median Earnings
Effectiveness in Serving Employers

Program Success across Sectors
Each Local Area defines its target industry sectors in its WIOA Local Plan, which must align with Maryland's State Plan and is based on Labor Market Information for that jurisdiction. Funds are spent to support target sectors and to meet target outcomes.

Program Barriers
In the WIOA Title III program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Insufficient funds to serve more customers; and
- Performance data lags since data reported is normally for activities that occurred six months or more prior and does not provide a real time picture of the current labor market or activities.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods

Performance can be tracked beyond the mandated performance if funds were available for that purpose, but it is not a requirement under WIOA.

III. Jobs for Veterans State Grants (JVSG)

The Jobs for Veterans State Grants (JVSG) provides Maryland with federal U.S. Department of Labor funding to support individualized career and training-related services to veterans and eligible persons with significant barriers to employment, as well as to assist employers in filling their workforce needs with job-seeking veterans.

Outcome Data
Performance is tracked in the MWE using wage records. Outcome data is tracked by the State and measured by the following:

JVSG Outcome Data
Employment Rate - 2nd Quarter After Exit
Employment Rate - 4th Quarter After Exit
Median Wages
Veterans' Employment Rate Quarter 2 (Wagner-Peyser or WP)
Veterans' Employment Rate Quarter 4 (WP)
Veterans' Median (WP)

Program Success Across Sectors
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers
In the JVSG Program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Archaic, ever changing, and confusing definitions of targeted groups and veterans;
- Limits to who an eligible veteran is under JVSG;
- Differing interpretations from Federal Project Officers on regulations;
- Performance data lags since data reported is normally for activities that occurred six months or more prior and does not provide a real time picture of the current labor market or activities;
- Transition in general;
- Eligible veterans, at times, have unrealistic expectations of the civilian workplace;
- Alignment of values with the business world (I.e. Commitment is a common value but the paradigms of what someone is committed to are not the same - excellence and customer satisfaction versus mission and duty);
- Lack of training and education that allows for changes in career paths, limiting the type of industries in which veterans can obtain employment;
- Criminal backgrounds that, at times, inhibit acceptance into training and obtaining employment;
- Affordable and reliable transportation; and,

- Veteran homelessness.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
Performance could be tracked beyond the mandated performance if funds were available for that purpose, but it is not a requirement under WIOA. The MWE is set up based on federal reporting requirements and can only track four quarters following exit. In order to track for longer periods, the MWE would require costly upgrades or a new system would have to be designed.

IV. Rapid Response

Rapid Response is a proactive, business-focused, and flexible strategy designed to respond to layoffs and plant closings by quickly coordinating services and providing immediate aid to companies and their affected workers. Rapid Response teams will work with employers and any employee representative(s) to quickly maximize public and private resources to minimize disruptions associated with job loss. Rapid Response can provide customized services on-site at an affected company, accommodate any work schedules, and assist companies and workers through the painful transitions associated with job loss.

Outcome Data
Outcome data is tracked by Local Area and the State via a combination of the MWE and internal tracking tools. Success is measured by the following indicators:

Rapid Response - Performance Indicators
Employer Penetration Rate - The total number of establishments, as defined by the Bureau of Labor Statistics Quarterly Census of Earnings and Wages program, that received a service or, if it is an ongoing activity, are continuing to receive a service or other assistance during the reporting period.
Total # of impacted workers
Total # of Rapid Response events
Rapid Response events supported

Program Success Across Sectors
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers
In the Rapid Response Program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Rapid Response activities are driven by downturns in a business;
- Performance is based on how funds are utilized in various ways (i.e. rapid response activities, layoff aversion, and referral to other services).

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
This is not applicable to Rapid Response.

V. Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA)

The Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) Program is a federal program that provides aid to workers who lose their jobs or whose hours of work and wages are reduced as a result of increased imports. The TAA program offers a variety of benefits and reemployment services to help unemployed workers prepare for and obtain suitable employment. Workers may be eligible for training, job search and relocation allowances, income support, and other reemployment services.

Outcome Data
Performance is tracked in a combination of the MWE using wage records and through other internal fiscal accounting tools. Outcome data is tracked by Local Areas and the State and performance is measured by the following:

Trade Adjustment Assistance – Indicators of Performance
Employment Rate - 2nd Quarter After Exit
Employment Rate - 4th Quarter After Exit
Median Earnings

Quarterly Reporting Performance Indicators Tracked beyond WIOA using the MWE and other Fiscal Accounting Tools
Training Expenditures
Trade Readjustment Allowance (TRA) Expenditures
Alternative Trade Adjustment Assistance (ATAA) / Reemployment Trade Adjustment Assistance (RTAA) Expenditures
Job Search / Relocation Expenditure
Rapid Response
Petition Number
Individualized Employment Plan (IEP)
Co-Enrollment
Case Management
Training Case Management
Training Completion
Credential
Service in Quarter
Occupational Information Network (ONET)
North American Industry Classification System (NAICS)
Wages

Program Success across Sectors
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers

In the TAA Program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:

- Insufficient funds to serve more customers; and
- Performance data lag since the data reported is normally for activities that occurred six months or more prior which does not provide a real time picture of the current labor market or activities.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods

Performance could be tracked beyond the mandated performance if funds were available for that purpose, but it is not a requirement under WIOA.

VI. Foreign Labor Certification

Foreign Labor Certification Programs are generally designed to assure that the admission of foreign workers to work in the United States on a permanent or temporary basis will not adversely affect the job opportunities, wages, and working conditions of American workers.

Outcome Data

Outcome data is tracked at the State level only and measured by the following:

H2B Visa Holder – Performance Indicators
Total # of job orders processed
Total # of active job orders from previous report
Total # of new job orders received
Total # of State Workforce Agency (SWA) staff assisted intrastate referrals
Total # of SWA staff assisted interstate referrals
Total # of interstate job orders transmitted to other SWAs
Total # of interstate job orders received from other SWAs
Total # of union contacts made
Total # of active job orders remaining at the end of the quarter

H2A Visa Holder – Performance Indicators
Total # of active job orders from previous report
Total # of new job orders received
Total # of job orders processed
Total # of SWA staff assisted intrastate referrals
Total # of SWA staff assisted interstate referrals
Total # of interstate job orders transmitted to other SWAs
Total # of interstate job orders received from other SWAs
Total # of active job orders remaining at the end of the quarter
Total # of prevailing wage surveys completed
Total # of employment practice surveys completed
Total # of housing inspections completed by SWA staff
Total # of housing inspections completed by alternative method
Total # of sleeping units inspected
Total capacity of sleeping units inspected
Total # of housing self-certifications received from employers

Program Success Across Sectors
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers
In the Foreign Labor Certification Program, obtaining cooperation from farms to provide data and information necessary for prevailing wage surveys is a barrier to successful participant outcomes.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
Data is tracked based on the United States Department of Labor (USDOL) guidance and in real time based on information requested quarterly.

VII. Migrant Seasonal Farmworker Program (MSFW)

The Migrant Seasonal Farmworker (MSFW) Program implements and maintains a federal and State monitoring and advocacy system to ensure the delivery of employment and training services, benefits, and protections to MSFWs on a non-discriminatory basis. The program requires that MSFWs receive workforce system services in a manner that is qualitatively equivalent and quantitatively proportionate to those provided to non-farmworkers.

Outcome Data
Performance is tracked in the MWE using wage records, and outcome data is tracked at the State level only and based on the following:

MSFW Performance Indicators
The # of MSFWs contacted through outreach activities
The # of MSFWs and non- MSFWs registered for career services
The # of MSFWs referred to and placed in agricultural jobs
The # of MSFWs referred to and placed in non-agricultural jobs
The percentage of MSFW program participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from the program
The median earnings of MSFW program participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from the program
The percentage of MSFW program participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the fourth quarter after exit from the program
The # of MSFWs served who identified themselves as male, female, Hispanic or Latino, Black or African-American, American Indian or Alaska Native, Asian, Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander, or White
Agricultural clearance orders (including field checks), MSFW complaints and apparent violations, and monitoring activities

Program Success Across Sectors

It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers:
In the MSFW Program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Only work-authorized MSFWs may access program services beyond self-services in an American Job Center (AJC) so often the State does not have any qualifying individuals; and,
- MSFW services do not differ from services provided in an AJC and add an additional program tracking that is unnecessary.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
Performance could be tracked beyond the mandated performance if funds were available for that purpose, but it is not a requirement under WIOA.

VIII. The Reemployment Opportunity Workshop (ROW) Program

The Reemployment Opportunity Workshop (ROW) Program offers a combination of workshops and targeted services to Unemployment Insurance (UI) claimants who have been identified as "likely to exhaust benefits" using an algorithm defined in concert with the Division of Workforce Development and Adult Learning (DWDAL) Office of Labor Market Analysis and Information and the MD Labor Division of Unemployment Insurance (DUI).

Outcome Data
Data is reported from MWE and tracked by Local Area and the State based on the following:

The ROW Program – Performance Indicators
Claimants Required to Participate
Completed Workshops
Referred to Employment, Training and Other Services
Placed in Job

Program Success across Sectors
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers:
In the ROW Program, collection of real time performance data is a barrier to successful participant outcomes.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
Performance can be tracked beyond the mandated performance if funds were available for that purpose but not a requirement under the federal grant.

IX. Reemployment Services and Eligibility Assessment (RESEA)

Reemployment Services and Eligibility Assessment (RESEA) is a U.S. Department of Labor funded grant operated by DWDAL in collaboration with the DUI. The primary objective of the program is to reduce the number of weeks that UI claimants receive benefits by assisting them in quickly returning to the workforce.

Outcome Data
Data is reported using the RESEA database and MWE. Wage records are not utilized for this specific program, but customers are reported in Wagner-Peyser using wage records. Data is tracked by Local Area and the State. Outcome data is measured by the following:

RESEA Performance Indicators
# of Claimants Scheduled for Their First RESEA
# of All RESEA Scheduled
# of RESEA Completed
Reporting to Reemployment Services or Training
Reporting to Reemployment Services
Reporting to Reemployment Training
of Completed Reemployment Eligibility Assessments (REAs) Resulting in A Disqualification or Overpayment
Disqualified for A Separation Issue
Disqualified for an Able And Available Issue
Disqualifying/Deductible Income
Disqualified for Refusal of Suitable Work Issue
Disqualified for Issue(s) Other Than #8-11
Resulting in an Overpayment
Dollar Amount of Overpayment Established
of (REAs) for Which the Claimant Failed to Appear
That Were Rescheduled Without Disqualification
Disqualified for Failure to Report under Reporting Requirements
Disqualified for Failure to Report under Issues Other Than Reporting
That Resulted in an Overpayment
Dollar Amount of Overpayment
# of Claimants That Failed to Report with no Disqualifications
# of Claimants That Returned to Work (If Available)

Program Success Across Sectors
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers
In the RESEA Program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:

- There is a lag time on entered employment data that does not match other data being reported; and,
- Splitting funding between two entities makes it more difficult to deliver services.

<u>Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods</u>
Data is tracked based on USDOL guidance and in real time based on information requested quarterly.

X. Senior Community Service Employment Program (SCSEP)

Senior Community Service Employment Program (SCSEP) services are designed to assist eligible older workers in developing workplace skills which will enable them to attain permanent, unsubsidized employment, either with their host agencies or other nonprofits, government, or private sector employers.

<u>Outcome Data</u>
Data is tracked in a USDOL database called SPARQ for reporting. Data is tracked and reported for the counties, and MD Labor serves 11 in the State. Senior Service America is the SCSEP provider for the remaining counties in Maryland. Labor uses Google Docs to collect local data for the 11 counties. Outcome data tracked includes:

SCSEP Performance Indicators
Employment Rate Quarter Two
Employment Rate Quarter Four
Median Wages
Hours (in the aggregate) of community service employment
The percentage of project participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from the project
The percentage of project participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the fourth quarter after exit from the project
The median earnings of project participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from the project
Indicators of effectiveness in serving employers, host agencies, and project participants
The # of eligible individuals served
The # of most-in-need individuals served (the number of participating individuals described in OAA sec. 518(a)(3)(B)(ii) or (b)(2))

<u>Program Success across Sectors</u>
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

<u>Program Barriers</u>
In the SCSEP Program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:

- Locating eligible older workers and host agencies willing to participate;
- Ensuring meaningful training situations for older workers;
- Moving from subsidized to unsubsidized employment is a program goal that does not always interest every participant; and
- Program is, at times, duplicative of the services offered under WIOA.

<u>Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods</u>
Performance could be tracked beyond the mandated performance if funds were available for that purpose, but it is not a requirement under WIOA.

XI. Business Services

MD Labor's Business Services increase the employment, retention, and earnings of Marylanders participating in programs and increase occupational skill attainment—especially in those job markets where there are skills gaps. As a result, the services improve the quality, productivity, and competitiveness of Maryland's workforce.

<u>Outcome Data</u>
Performance tracked in the MWE is based on services entered. The services include:

Business Services Tracked
Effectiveness in Serving Employers -Enhancing business engagement through the development of comprehensive business services teams and strategies which align businesses, trade associations, trade unions, chambers of commerce, community colleges, and other community-based organizations with resources dedicated to business outreach;
Creating regional business service units;
Aligning of apprenticeship opportunities with workforce development; and,
Expanding industry-driven models, such as "EARN."

Outcome data is tracked in MWE by jurisdiction (Local Area) and provider (User). The MWE allows staff to run reports and monitor services such as employers registered, job postings, and services provided. The employer reports provide data such as internal and external job order information, employer registration information, and job referrals. The employer reports are divided into categories:

Employer Report Categories
<u>Job Order</u> – These reports include data from internal job orders created by preferred employers (employers who registered in the system) and external jobs (jobs that were spidered in from outside sources).
<u>Registered Employer</u> – These reports display the information provided by employers during registration.
<u>Referrals and Referral Results</u> – These reports list job referrals by region, office, referring staff member, and referral type.

<u>Program Success Across Sectors</u>

Per Maryland's State WIOA plan, approved by the Governor's Workforce Development Board, the targeted industries across the state are:
- Construction;
- Healthcare;
- Information Technology/Cybersecurity;
- Manufacturing;
- Life Science; and
- Agriculture.

Additionally, each local area in their local WIOA plans identified targeted industries based on their local labor market and demographics.

Program Barriers
For Maryland's Business Services, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Collaboration with partners that have various performance requirements across twelve (12) workforce areas and multiple outreach programs;
- Use of funds limited to outreach under federal guidance;
- Competing priorities among partners;
- The MWE contains information entered by staff, as well as employer data, and often, in regard to the staff entered data, staff does not always take credit and record all the services they supply; and
- Not all partners providing services utilize the MWE system, therefore, the data is not always measured accurately.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
Performance in the Maryland Workforce Exchange for this program is ongoing and can always be searched and reported in real time.

XII. Work Opportunity Tax Credit (WOTC)

The Tax Credit Programs Unit administers federal and State employer tax credit programs. These programs consist of the federal "Work Opportunity Tax Credit (WOTC)," the State "Maryland Disability Employment Tax Credit (MDETC)," and the Enterprise Zone Tax Credit. State tax credits have primarily been legislative mandates which come with no administrative funding and have built on the federal tax credit.

Outcome Data
Data is tracked in a separate WOTC database and reported via federal guidance to USDOL quarterly. A report is generated yearly for the state tax credits. Data measures and outcomes include:

System Inputs
Incomplete Requests
Requests Needing Action
New Requests
Total Requests to be Processed

Certified Requests
Denied Requests

System Outputs
Incomplete Requests
Requests Needing Action

Demographic Data
By WIOA Target Group
# of Conditional Certifications (CCs) 9062s Resulting in Certifications
Certified Individuals
Certified By Occupation
Certified By Starting Hourly Wage

Program Success across Sectors
State and federal tax credits have historically benefitted food service and retail employers that have low wages.

Program Barriers
For the WOTC, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Tax credit is, in theory, supposed to be an incentive to hire skilled workers, but that is not how it practically works most of the time;
- In many cases, it is used to offset the cost of hiring that would have been hired without the tax credit;
- Lack of state and federal funds to keep up with the volume of credits; and,
- Delays in processing brought on by yearly delays in Congress on reauthorization.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
Tracking outcomes for longer periods is not applicable to this program. Performance is real time and there is no requirement of the program to track individual credits beyond approval.

XIII. Registered Apprenticeship Expansion Grant Programs

The Registered Apprenticeship Expansion Grant Programs are funded by federal U.S. Department of Labor grant awards that aim to support programs that:
- Expand the number of Registered Apprentices in Registered Apprenticeship programs nationwide;
- Support and encourage the diversification of Registered Apprenticeship programs, including increasing diversity of Registered Apprentices and growing Registered Apprenticeship across industry sectors; and
- Support the integration of Registered Apprenticeship programs into state workforce development strategies.

Outcome Data

Data is tracked by each of the various sub-awardees through monthly reports submitted to MD Labor. Starting in mid-2020, as the result of the development of a specialized apprenticeship module, data is now also tracked by each of those sub-awarded using the MWE. Data is tracked via provider and wage records and outcomes are measured by the following:

Registered Apprenticeship Expansion Grant Programs – Performance Indicators
#of new apprentices enrolled as a result of grant activities
# of new minorities and women as apprentices
# of new apprenticeship programs created as a result of grant activities
# of business outreach contacts made to support apprenticeship expansion
# of apprentices assisted with workforce funding

Program Success Across Sectors
The program tracks industry sectors that work with apprentices. Reports are available upon request.

Program Barriers
In the deployment of the Registered Apprenticeship Expansion Grant Programs, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Deficiencies in basic literacy skills;
- Deficiencies in basic and applied construction math skills;
- Lack of prior hands-on experience; and
- Inability to secure reliable transportation to get to the program/work.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
For this grant program, MD Labor is required to track outcomes including the following: number of new apprentices enrolled as a result of grant activities, number of new minorities and women as apprentices, number of new apprenticeship programs created as a result of grant activities, number of business outreach contacts made to support apprenticeship expansion, and number of apprentices assisted with workforce funding.

XIV. Youth Apprenticeship – Apprenticeship Maryland Program (AMP)

The Apprenticeship Maryland Program (AMP) is a State program that provides businesses the unique opportunity to train, influence, and shape high school students into top-performing employees who are invested in the program and business community.

Outcome Data
Data is not tracked using wage records; rather, it is tracked by participating counties and State reports. AMP tracks the following outcome data:

AMP Outcome Data
# of Total Youth Apprentices

# of Participating Businesses
# of Participating School Systems
Current Average Hourly Wage

Program Success Across Sectors

The program tracks industry sectors that work with apprentices. Reports are available upon request.

Program Barriers

In the AMP Program, the fact that the program is limited to in-school youth is a barrier to successful participant outcomes.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods

Performance can be tracked for longer periods by MD Labor if a youth apprentice enters a Registered Apprenticeship.

XV. Older Worker Demonstration Grant

The Older Worker Demonstration Grant:
- Expands the capacity of the public workforce system to serve low-income older workers;
- Develops (if not already in place) and implements a replicable and innovative model for service delivery for this population;
- Documents the model and identifies lessons learned for sharing with other states; and
- Will achieve sustainability once grant funds are exhausted or the project has ended through connecting to the Maryland Eligible Training Provider List or by other means.

Outcome Data

Data is tracked by participating Local Area using MWE, wage records, and quarterly reports. Data collected includes: Participant Services Received, Participant Outcomes, and Employment Indicators.

Older Worker Demonstration Grant - Performance Indicators
Participant Services Received (i.e., occupational training, Registered Apprenticeship, etc.)
Participant Outcomes:
Increase by 10 % the number of older workers receiving WIOA-funded services;
At least 70 % of the customers placed in unsubsidized employment by quarter two after exit will still be employed quarter four following exit;
At least 60 % of customers enrolled in training will complete training; and
At least 70 % of enrolled customers will be placed in unsubsidized jobs at or above the minimum hourly living wage rate;
Employment Indicators:
Employment Rate- 2nd Quarter After Exit
Employment Rate- 4th Quarter After Exit

Median Earnings- 2nd Quarter After Exit

Program Success across Sectors
The Grantee defines the industry based on local projects and businesses engaged. Therefore, it is difficult to make a determination across sectors.

Program Barriers
In the Older Worker Demonstration Grant, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Locating eligible older workers and host agencies willing to participate;
- Ensuring meaningful training situations for older workers;
- Moving from subsidized to unsubsidized employment is a program goal that does not always interest every participant; and
- Program is, at times, duplicative of the services offered under WIOA.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
The grant requires tracking per WIOA guidelines, and once the grant ends, additional funds will no longer be available to continue programming and to track data.

XVI. COVID-19 National Dislocated Worker Grant (NDWG)

The COVID-19 National Dislocated Worker Grant (NDWG) awards discretionary grants to grantees that will provide employment-related services for dislocated workers. Specifically, Disaster Recovery Dislocated Worker Grants provide disaster-relief and humanitarian assistance employment, as well as employment and training services, as appropriate, to minimize the employment and economic impact of declared disasters and emergency situations.

Outcome Data
Data is tracked by Local Area and the State via MWE and wage records. Outcome data is measured by the following:

COVID-19 NDWG – Performance Indicators
Employment Rate – Second Quarter after exit
Employment Rate – Fourth Quarter after exit
Median Earnings
Credential rate
Measurable Skill Gains
Effectiveness in Serving Employers

Program Success Across Sectors
It is difficult to make that type of comparison across programs that do not use the same performance standards and without first defining "success" beyond the mandated federal performance standards.

Program Barriers

In the COVID-19 NDWG, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Locating eligible participants; and,
- Ensuring appropriate worksites were identified.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
This grant requires tracking per WIOA guidelines, and once the grant ends, additional funds will no longer be available to track data.

XVII. *Highway and Capital Transit Training and Supportive Services Program*

The Highway and Capital Transit Training and Supportive Services Program seeks to address Maryland's workforce needs in highway and capital transit construction. Maryland's participating Local Areas provide local jobseekers with contextualized learning opportunities, training, and supportive services in highway and capital transit construction industries.

Outcome Data
Data is tracked by Local Area via MWE and wage records. Outcome data tracked includes:

Highway and Capital Transit Training and Supportive Services Program - Performance Indicators
Of those who completed the training, how many obtained an industry-recognized credential or certificate of completion?
Of those who completed the training, how many participants have documentation of the removal of at least three significant barriers?
Of those who completed the training, how many were placed in unsubsidized jobs at or above the minimum hourly living wage rate set by law for your applicable Tier area?
Of those placed in unsubsidized employment, how many participants retained that job for at least six consecutive calendar months?
Of those placed in unsubsidized employment, how many participants became eligible for benefits (e.g. medical) within one year of the date of employment?

Program Success Across Sectors
The grant requires that training be limited to occupations within the construction field. This is mandated in State statute.

Program Barriers
In the deployment of the Highway and Capital Transit Training and Supportive Services Program, the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:
- Deficiencies in basic literacy skills;
- Deficiencies in basic and applied construction math skills;
- Lack of prior hands-on experience; and,
- Inability to secure reliable transportation to get to the program/work.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods
For grant programs such as this, awardees are required to track participant outcomes including the following: number enrolled, number receiving a certificate or credential, number placed into

unsubsidized employment, and job retention. Awardees continue tracking participant outcomes for six months after participant exit from the training.

XVIII.   *Employment Advancement Right Now (EARN) Maryland*

Employment Advancement Right Now (EARN) Maryland is a State-funded, competitive workforce development grant program that is industry-led, regional in focus, and a proven strategy for helping businesses cultivate the skilled workforce they need to compete. EARN Maryland invests in strategic industry partnerships from key economic sectors in every region. These partnerships use the power of coordination across education, workforce, and economic development initiatives to address the multiple needs of companies, starting with the training of skilled workers.

Outcome Data
EARN grantees do not track retention of program participants. EARN data is tracked by provider. EARN tracks both demographic and outcome data including:

EARN Demographic and Outcome Data
Date of Birth
County of Residence
Race
Sex
National Origin
Highest Level of Education
Veteran Status
Employment Status pre-training - including hourly wage and number of hours worked at current or previous job
Completion
Certification/credential attainment
Identifiable skill attainment
Employment Status post-training including employment in target industry, hourly wage, and number of hours worked at current or previous job

Program Success across Sectors
There is little variance in success across sectors. Rather, there may be variance in program success between grantees implementing training programs in the same sector. This is dependent upon the rigor of programming and the goals of partnerships. For instance, some training programs operate as a simulated work environment with the goal of only "graduating" individuals who are deemed work ready. If a trainee is unable to be timely on a consistent basis, or remain engaged in training, they may be dismissed from the program. In these instances, the program may show lower completion rates, but have a higher placement rate. This may vary across training programs in the same sector.

Program Barriers:
In the EARN Program the following barriers to successful participant outcomes were identified:

- Many EARN grantees train a large number of individuals, making data collection and reporting an onerous task; and,
- Incumbent workers are leery of providing some of the required data points.

Feasibility of Tracking Outcomes for Longer Periods

This would likely require grantees to hire additional staff and would come at a cost to the State.

Conclusion

As this report details, MD Labor offers a plethora of workforce development programs, all different, but with similar goals of supporting jobseekers, businesses, and the workforce system as a whole. The outcome and data tracking of programs varies; however, all collection is aligned with MD Labor and the overarching goals of the *Benchmarks of Success*.